Searches for GeV to PeV neutrinos from gravitational sources with IceCube

Aswathi Balagopal V., Raamis Hussain, Alex Pizzuto, Justin Vandenbroucke for the IceCube collaboration TeVPA 2021







Motivation

- Several predictions for the production of neutrinos from binary mergers
- Mainly from BNS and BHNS mergers
- Processes may vary for high and low energy nutrinos
- We search for neutrino events from GW events detected by LIGO-Virgo
- Searches done both in the high energy (> 1 TeV), low energy (<1 TeV) and extremely low energy (< 5 GeV) regime



Effective areas

- Three datasets with complementary effective areas used for GW follow-up analyses
- High energy dataset: neutrinos of muon flavour; better effective area in the northern hemisphere
- Low energy: neutrinos of all flavours; nearly-uniform effective area in the whole sky
- Low energy dataset is more background dominated
- ~1°angular error for >1 TeV; median ~10-50°angular error for <1 TeV



PoS(ICRC2021)1131

Summary of the GW events

- We want to follow up GW events in O1, O2 and O3a runs of LIGO-Virgo
- GWTC-1 catalog: O1+O2 (Sept. 12 2015 Jan. 19 2016 + Nov. 30 2016 -Aug. 25 2017)
- GWTC-1 contains 11 GW events
- GWTC-2 catalog: O3a (April 1 2019 Oct. 12019)
- GWTC-2 catalog has 39 events
- An updated catalog GWTC-2.1 available
- Revised version of GWTC-2; with 44 GW events (37 events from GWTC-2 and 8 new events)
- Working on following-up this revised catalog
- In this talk: GWTC-1 +GWTC-2



Extremely low energy analysis — Counting method

The unbinned maximum likelihood method

- Time window: 1000 s (± 500 s)
- Scan over the sky, look for overlap between neutrino and GW events
- Spatial prior (w) from healpix skymap of GW events
- Maximum best-fit value (TS) recorded for each trial for each GW event

Likelihood
$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{(n_s + n_b)^N}{N!} e^{-(n_s + n_b)} \prod_{i=1}^N \left(\frac{n_s S_i}{n_s + n_b} + \frac{n_b \mathcal{B}_i}{n_s + n_b} \right)$$

ypothesis testing Test Statistic (TS) = max. $\left\{ 2 \ln \left(\frac{\mathcal{L}_k(n_s, \gamma) \cdot w_k}{\mathcal{L}_k(n_s = 0)} \right) \right\}$
Evaluate at all pixels 7

Background distributions



Sensitivity calculation

- Inject neutrinos with given flux level
- Fraction of trials (pseudo-expts.) with TS value > median of background TS (passing fraction)
- Fit χ 2 cdf; PF = 0.9 gives the 90% sensitivity
- Calculated for all GW events



ApJ. Lett. 898 (2020) L10

Sensitivities (O1&O2)



predictions

(markers), and 68% prob. regions (error bars)

10

Results: High Energy Analysis

• No significant neutrino emission was seen in O1+O2

ApJ. Lett. 898 (2020) L10

| O1 and O2 Detections | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------|------|-----------|-----------|------------------------|--------------------------|---------|-----------------------|-----------------------|---------|-----------------------|
| | | | | | Maximum Likelihood LLAMA | | | | | |
| Event | Type | Detectors | Ω | D_L | UL Range | p-value | UL | $E_{\rm iso}$ UL | p-value | UL |
| Lvent | Type | | (deg^2) | (Mpc) | (GeVcm^{-2}) | | (GeVcm^{-2}) | (erg) | | (GeVcm^{-2}) |
| GW150914 | BBH | LH | 182 | 440^{+150}_{-170} | 0.0296 - 1.03 | 0.51 | 0.66 | 5.10×10^{53} | 0.29 | 0.70 |
| GW151012 | BBH | LH | 1523 | 1080^{+550}_{-490} | 0.0286 - 0.821 | 0.83 | 0.16 | 7.50×10^{53} | 0.82 | 0.18 |
| GW151226 | BBH | LH | 1033 | 450^{+180}_{-190} | 0.0286 - 0.904 | 0.74 | 0.22 | 1.74×10^{53} | 0.26 | 0.21 |
| GW170104 | BBH | LH | 921 | 990^{+440}_{-430} | 0.0286 - 0.667 | 0.54 | 0.044 | 1.81×10^{53} | 0.16 | 0.055 |
| GW170608 | BBH | LH | 392 | 320^{+120}_{-110} | 0.0309 - 0.0821 | 0.61 | 0.037 | 1.37×10^{52} | 0.97 | 0.038 |
| GW170729 | BBH | LH | 1041 | 2840^{+1400}_{-1360} | 0.0286 - 1.02 | 0.21 | 0.62 | 1.80×10^{55} | 0.17 | 0.62 |
| GW170809 | BBH | LH | 308 | 1030^{+320}_{-390} | 0.0568 - 0.758 | 0.60 | 0.27 | 1.02×10^{54} | 0.83 | 0.26 |
| GW170814 | BBH | LHV | 87 | 600^{+150}_{-220} | 0.488 - 0.711 | 0.83 | 0.45 | 5.47×10^{53} | 1.0 | 0.43 |
| GW170817 | BNS | LHV | 16 | 40^{+7}_{-15} | 0.180 - 0.429 | 0.19 | 0.27 | 1.67×10^{51} | 0.94 | 0.25 |
| GW170818 | BBH | LHV | 39 | 1060^{+420}_{-380} | 0.0364 - 0.0431 | 0.58 | 0.028 | 1.17×10^{53} | 0.40 | 0.028 |
| GW170823 | BBH | LH | 1666 | 1940_{-900}^{+970} | 0.0286 - 0.796 | 0.75 | 0.18 | 2.33×10^{54} | 0.25 | 0.18 |

Results: High Energy Analysis

- No significant neutrino emission was seen in O3a
 One event with p-value < 0.1 in UML method (also in LLAMA) method)

| PoS(ICRC2021)950] | |
|--------------------|--|
|--------------------|--|

| | LI | AMA | UML | | | |
|-----------------|------|-----------------|------------------------|-----------------|------------------------|-----------------------|
| Ermet | Туре | <i>p</i> -value | E ² F UL | <i>p</i> -value | E ² F UL | E III [ana] |
| Event | | | [GeVcm ⁻²] | | [GeVcm ⁻²] | Eiso UL [erg] |
| GW190408_181802 | BBH | 0.16 | 0.048 | 0.17 | 0.0512 | 4.85×10^{53} |
| GW190412 | BBH | 0.19 | 0.041 | 0.13 | 0.0459 | 8.31×10^{52} |
| GW190413_052954 | BBH | 0.21 | 0.087 | 0.28 | 0.133 | 7.01×10^{54} |
| GW190413_134308 | BBH | 0.18 | 0.34 | 0.34 | 0.270 | 2.84×10^{55} |
| GW190421_213856 | BBH | 0.77 | 0.46 | 0.56 | 0.393 | 1.40×10^{55} |
| GW190424_180648 | BBH | 0.58 | 0.32 | 0.23 | 0.233 | 5.37×10^{54} |
| GW190425 | BNS | 0.16 | 0.22 | 0.94 | 0.176 | 1.66×10^{52} |
| GW190426_152155 | NSBH | 0.12 | 0.082 | 0.12 | 0.0942 | 5.65×10^{52} |
| GW190503_185404 | BBH | 0.87 | 0.54 | 0.34 | 0.584 | 4.99×10^{54} |
| GW190512_180714 | BBH | 0.67 | 0.23 | 0.85 | 0.199 | 1.74×10^{54} |
| GW190513_205428 | BBH | 0.97 | 0.043 | 0.94 | 0.0514 | 6.73×10^{53} |
| GW190514_065416 | BBH | 0.28 | 0.089 | 0.44 | 0.0453 | 3.96×10^{54} |
| GW190517_055101 | BBH | 0.14 | 0.48 | 0.26 | 0.366 | 6.05×10^{54} |
| GW190519_153544 | BBH | 0.063 | 0.15 | 0.21 | 0.0914 | 3.20×10^{54} |
| GW190521 | BBH | 0.47 | 0.37 | 0.63 | 0.359 | 1.90×10^{55} |
| GW190521_074359 | BBH | 0.16 | 0.049 | 0.15 | 0.0451 | 2.36×10^{53} |
| GW190527_092055 | BBH | 0.61 | 0.41 | 0.88 | 0.326 | 1.01×10^{55} |
| GW190602_175927 | BBH | 0.22 | 0.34 | 0.17 | 0.370 | 9.73×10^{54} |
| GW190620_030421 | BBH | 0.15 | 0.36 | 0.23 | 0.121 | 4.13×10^{54} |

| | | 12 XX | | | | | |
|---|-----------------|-------|-------|-------|------|--------|-----------------------|
| | GW190630_185205 | BBH | 0.38 | 0.15 | 0.81 | 0.427 | 5.31×10^{53} |
| | GW190701_203306 | BBH | 1.0 | 0.039 | 0.87 | 0.0385 | 7.65×10^{53} |
| | GW190706_222641 | BBH | 0.99 | 0.036 | 0.92 | 0.0356 | 3.17×10^{54} |
| 1 | GW190707_093326 | BBH | 0.43 | 0.24 | 0.63 | 0.202 | 4.74×10^{53} |
| | GW190708_232457 | BBH | 0.11 | 0.11 | 0.56 | 0.0720 | 1.62×10^{53} |
| | GW190719_215514 | BBH | 0.79 | 0.054 | 0.91 | 0.0512 | 4.90×10^{54} |
| | GW190720_000836 | BBH | 0.98 | 0.13 | 0.94 | 0.0872 | 5.34×10^{53} |
| | GW190727_060333 | BBH | 0.79 | 0.38 | 0.74 | 0.324 | 1.53×10^{55} |
| | GW190728_064510 | BBH | 0.013 | 0.89 | 0.04 | 0.315 | 6.36×10^{53} |
| | GW190731_140936 | BBH | 0.29 | 0.93 | 0.61 | 0.385 | 1.81×10^{55} |
| | GW190803_022701 | BBH | 0.21 | 0.037 | 0.64 | 0.0354 | 1.69×10^{54} |
| | GW190814 | BBH | 1.0 | 0.24 | 1.0 | 0.259 | 5.68×10^{52} |
| | GW190828_063405 | BBH | 0.86 | 0.21 | 0.98 | 0.178 | 2.74×10^{54} |
| | GW190828_065509 | BBH | 0.72 | 0.38 | 0.84 | 0.368 | 3.73×10^{54} |
| | GW190909_114149 | BBH | 0.56 | 0.11 | 0.39 | 0.136 | 1.33×10^{55} |
| | GW190910_112807 | BBH | 0.16 | 0.45 | 0.77 | 0.177 | 1.90×10^{54} |
| | GW190915_235702 | BBH | 0.40 | 0.036 | 0.44 | 0.0354 | 3.61×10^{53} |
| | GW190924_021846 | BBH | 0.038 | 0.037 | 0.23 | 0.0346 | 4.46×10^{52} |
| | GW190929_012149 | BBH | 0.091 | 0.34 | 0.22 | 0.276 | _ |
| | GW190930_133541 | BBH | 0.19 | 0.038 | 0.31 | 0.0427 | 1.05×10^{53} |
| | | | | | | | |

Results: High Energy Analysis

- Neutrino arrived 360 s before the GW merger
- Had a reconstructed energy of 601 GeV
- No counterparts found from other observatories
- observatories
 Event also found in realtime follow-up, and a GCN circular was sent





Sky localization of the most significant event

[PoS(ICRC2021)950]

Eiso upper limits



- 90% UL on the isotropic equivalent energy emitted in high-energy neutrinos
 Total rest mass energy of the progenitors and total radiated energy of the system is also shown
- Grey bands represent the expectation (based on the sensitivities)
- [¬][¬]• Eiso UL on GRB170817A is 4 orders of magnitude lower than that on neutrinos

Two week follow-up

- Longer time scale: [-0.1,+14] day time window
- Done for all candidate BNS and NSBH events (at least one compact object with mass < 3 M_{\odot}
- Motivated by theroretical predictions
- No significant neutrino emission seen

| Event | Туре | <i>p</i> -value | $E^{2}FUL$ [GeVcm ⁻²] |
|-----------------|------|-----------------|-----------------------------------|
| GW190425 | BNS | 0.43 | 0.661 |
| GW190426_152155 | NSBH | 0.21 | 0.248 |
| GW190814 | BBH | 0.59 | 0.309 |



- We search for neutrino counterparts to GWs in the < 1TeV and > 1 TeV energy regimes
- Follow-up of events in GWTC-1 and GWTC-2 detected by LIGO-Virgo is done
- Sensitivities with unbinned maximum likelihood method (for high and low energy follow-up analyses) shown here
- Unblinded results of high energy neutrino search presented
- No significant emission found
- Stay tuned for more on this

Backup

Background TS distribution

- Determined by running 10000 trials for each GW event
- Prior derived from corresponding GW skymap
- Negative values in the TS distribution arise from the spatial prior
- All -inf values set at -21 for pictorial representation
- Get the median/3 sigma from the background TS distribution for sensitivity/discovery potential calculations



Angular uncertainty from Random Forest



For muon neutrinos and anti neutrinos

[Alex Pizzuto]

Energy resolution



0.1 to 0.2

Energy resolution at different $\text{sin}(\delta)$ bins, with 68% contours

10⁰

0.6 to 0.7

Catalog details

- GWTC-1 for O1, O2 runs: 11 events out of which 1 BNS and 10 BBH
- GWTC-2 for O3a run (with FAR as the threshold parameter): 39 events; 1 NSBH and 38 BBH
- GWTC-2.1 for O3a run (with p_{astro} as the threshold parameter): 44 events, 3 removed from GWTC-2 (1 NSBH also removed); 1 new NSBH and 43 BBH
 - Links: GWTC-1, GWTC-2, GWTC-2.1

BNS and NSBH events

- 02: GW170817--> BNS
- O3a: GW190426_152155--> NSBH in GWTC-2, rejected in GWTC-2.1 since pastro < 0.5
- O3a: 190917_114630--> NSBH in GWTC-2.1
- O3a: 190725_174728--> one of the two objects with solar mass between 2 and 5 (but still classified as BBH)

GeV neutrino emission from mergers

Predictions of GeV neutrino emission

- BNS, BHNS mergers mainly with GRB progenitors
- Produced in subphotospheric region
- P and n decouple (either during acceleration stage or later) have inelastic collisions (pion production)
- Neutrino emission in GeV range



- K. Murase, K. Kashiyama, P. Mezaros, Subphotospheric Neutrinos from Gamma-Ray Bursts: The Role of Neutrons, arXiv:1301.4236
- N. Fraija, MeV-GeV neutrino propagation as a signal of magnetic field amplification in neutron star merger , Journal of High Energy Astrophysics, Vol. 11-12, 2016, Pg. 29-43
- P. Meszaros, M.J. Rees, Multi-GeV Neutrinos from Internal Dissipationin GRB Fireballs, arXiv: 0007102
- John N. Bahcall, Peter Meszaros, 5-10 GeV Neutrinos from Gamma-Ray Burst Fireballs, arXiv: 0004019