





Tensor Polarization and Spectral Properties of Vector Meson in QCD Medium

Shuai Liu

Hunan University

In collaboration: Feng Li

Special thanks to Yi Yin

Chirality 2023, July 15-20, 2023 Beijing, China

Based on work, Li and Liu, arXiv: 2206.11890 and Liu & Rapp series research 2018-2022

Postdoc position at Hunan University, please contact: lshphy@hnu.edu.cn

Outline

- 1) Spin observables in heavy-ion collisions
- 2) Theory for tensor polarization and spin alignment
- 3) Spectral properties of in-medium mesonic resonance
- 4) Phenomenology implications
- 5) Summary and outlooks

Outline

1) Spin observables in heavy-ion collisions

- 2) Theory for tensor polarization and spin alignment
- 3) Spectral properties of in-medium mesonic resonance
- 4) Phenomenology implications
- 5) Summary and outlooks

Vorticity Induced Polarization



– x

Local Polarization and Shear Induced Polarization



Local Polarization and Shear Induced Polarization



Challenges on Spin Alignment



Challenges on Spin Alignment



New ideas

- New external field Sheng, Oliva, Liang, Wang, Wang, 2206.05868
- ✤Initial stage physics, such as Glasma Kumar, Müller, Yang, PRD 2023
- Study with thermal field theory carefully, discover missing effects, such as Shear Induced Tensor Polarization (SITP)

```
Li, Liu, 2022,
arXiv:2206.11890
```

Attempt to convince you in this talk that these new effects are:

- Natural, appeared naturally once included more realistic physics in theory
- Universal, applying to all interacting medium with massive vector boson
- Large and Rich, magnitude can be large & containing rich physics

Similar physics also discussed later in Wagner, Weickgenannt, Speranza , PRR, 2022

Outline

1) Spin observables in heavy-ion collisions

2) Theory for tensor polarization and spin alignment

3) Spectral properties of in-medium mesonic resonance

4) Phenomenology implications

5) Summary and outlooks

Structure of the density matrix

The spin-1 boson has (8 degrees of freedom)

$$\rho_{ss'} = \begin{pmatrix} \rho_{11} & \rho_{10} & \rho_{1-1} \\ \rho_{01} & \rho_{00} & \rho_{0-1} \\ \rho_{-11} & \rho_{-10} & \rho_{-1-1} \end{pmatrix} = \frac{1}{3} \delta_{ss'} + \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{P}_k(J_k)_{ss'} - \mathcal{T}_{ij}(J_{(i}J_{j)} - \frac{2}{3}\delta_{ij}\mathbf{1})_{ss'}$$

$$J_{1} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, J_{2} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & -i & 0 \\ i & 0 & -i \\ 0 & i & 0 \end{pmatrix}, J_{3} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & -1 \end{pmatrix}$$

Structure of the density matrix



$$\rho = \begin{pmatrix} p_+ & & \\ & p_0 & \\ & & p_- \end{pmatrix}$$

✤Trivial case $p_+ = p_- = p_0 = 1/3$, no polarization

♦ Vector Polarization exist when $\mathcal{P} = p_+ - p_- \neq 0$

★Tensor Polarization & alignment exist if $p_0 \neq 1/3$, $T_{zz} = \rho_{00} - \frac{1}{3}$ (Even $\mathcal{P} = 0$, when $p_+ = p_-$,)

***Only** the tensor polarization part contribute to $\rho_{00} - 1/3$



Structure of the density matrix



★Tensor Polarization & alignment exist if $p_0 \neq 1/3$, $T_{zz} = \rho_{00} - \frac{1}{3}$ (Even $\mathcal{P} = 0$, when $p_+ = p_-$,)

***Only** the tensor polarization part contribute to $\rho_{00} - 1/3$

Relation to Wigner function

Full Wigner function

$$W^{\mu\nu}(x, \mathbf{p}) \equiv \varepsilon_{\mathbf{p}} \int dp^0 \int d^4 y e^{ip \cdot y} \langle V^{\mu}(x_-) V^{\nu}(x_+) \rangle = W^{\mu\nu}_+(x, \mathbf{p}) + W^{\mu\nu}_-(x, \mathbf{p})$$

• Positive mode $W_{+}^{\mu\nu}$, with projections, and normalization

$$\mathcal{W}^{\mu\nu}(x, \mathbf{p}) \equiv 2\tilde{\Delta}^{\mu}_{\alpha}\tilde{\Delta}^{\nu}_{\beta}W^{\alpha\beta}_{+}(x, \mathbf{p})$$
 $\qquad \begin{array}{l} \widetilde{\Delta} = -\eta^{\mu\nu} + \widetilde{p}^{\mu}\widetilde{p}^{\nu}/\widetilde{p}^{2} \\ \widetilde{p} \text{ is on-shell 4 momentum} \end{array}$

The density matrices related to it as

$$\varrho_{ss'}(x, \boldsymbol{p}) = \epsilon^{\mu}_{s'}(\boldsymbol{p})\epsilon^{\nu*}_{s}(\boldsymbol{p})\mathcal{W}_{\mu\nu}(x, \boldsymbol{p})$$

*****Decomposition of $\mathcal{W}^{\mu\nu}$

$$\mathcal{W}^{\mu
u} = \frac{1}{3} \tilde{\Delta}^{\mu
u} \mathcal{S} + \mathcal{W}^{[\mu
u]} + \mathcal{T}^{\mu
u}$$

 $\mathcal{T}^{\mu
u} \equiv \mathcal{W}^{\langle\mu
u
angle} \equiv \mathcal{W}^{(\mu
u)} - \frac{1}{3} \tilde{\Delta}^{\mu
u} \mathcal{S} = 2 \tilde{\Delta}^{\langle\mu}_{\lambda} \tilde{\Delta}^{\nu
angle}_{\gamma} W^{(\lambda\gamma)}_{+}$

Related to Wigner function

Full Wigner function

$$W^{\mu\nu}(x, \mathbf{p}) \equiv \varepsilon_{\mathbf{p}} \int dp^0 \int d^4 y e^{ip \cdot y} \langle V^{\mu}(x_-) V^{\nu}(x_+) \rangle = W^{\mu\nu}_+(x, \mathbf{p}) + W^{\mu\nu}_-(x, \mathbf{p})$$

• Positive mode $W_{+}^{\mu\nu}$, with projections, and normalization

$$\mathcal{W}^{\mu\nu}(x, \mathbf{p}) \equiv 2\tilde{\Delta}^{\mu}_{\alpha}\tilde{\Delta}^{\nu}_{\beta}W^{\alpha\beta}_{+}(x, \mathbf{p})$$
 $\qquad \qquad \widetilde{\Delta} = -\eta^{\mu\nu} + \widetilde{p}^{\mu}\widetilde{p}^{\nu}/\widetilde{p}^{2} \\ \widetilde{p} \text{ is on-shell 4 momentum}$

The density matrices related to it as

$$\varrho_{ss'}(x, \boldsymbol{p}) = \epsilon^{\mu}_{s'}(\boldsymbol{p})\epsilon^{\nu*}_{s}(\boldsymbol{p})\mathcal{W}_{\mu\nu}(x, \boldsymbol{p})$$

*****Decomposition of $\mathcal{W}^{\mu\nu}$

*****Tensor polarization T

$$\mathcal{W}^{\mu
u} \equiv \mathcal{W}^{\langle\mu
u
angle} \equiv \mathcal{W}^{(\mu
u)} - rac{1}{3} \tilde{\Delta}^{\mu
u} \mathcal{S} = 2 \tilde{\Delta}^{\langle\mu}_{\ \lambda} \tilde{\Delta}^{
u
angle}_{\ \gamma} W^{(\lambda\gamma)}_+$$

Gradient Expansion and Symmetry analysis

Expansion up to 1st order gradient expansion

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{T}^{\mu\nu} = &\tilde{\Delta}^{\langle\mu}_{\lambda}\tilde{\Delta}^{\nu\rangle}_{\gamma} \left[\kappa^{u}_{0}u^{\lambda}u^{\gamma} + \kappa^{u}_{1}u^{\lambda}u^{\gamma} + \kappa_{\mathrm{sh}}\sigma^{\lambda\gamma} + \kappa_{T}u^{(\lambda}\partial^{\gamma)}_{\perp}\beta \right. \\ & \left. + \kappa_{\mathrm{su}}u^{(\lambda}\sigma^{\gamma)\alpha}\tilde{p}_{\alpha} + \kappa_{\mathrm{ou}}u^{(\lambda}\Omega^{\gamma)\alpha}\tilde{p}_{\alpha} + \cdots \right] \\ \text{T-even} & \text{T-even, 0th order} & \text{T-odd, Shear Again!} \end{split}$$

Early theories include terms such as $(\omega/T)^2 \sim (1/100)^2$, 2nd order in gradient

Many Missing BUT Naturally Allowed Contribution at Lower Orders!

- Why missed before?
 - In-medium spectral properties/interactions required, not been well studied before
 - Shear Induced Tensor Polarization(SITP) with κ_{sh} to be T-odd and indicate the nature of the dissipative physics, not been studied before

Could we find these terms in a concrete calculation? Yes, see later

0th order—a compact non-perturbative result

The tensor polarization related to spectral function as

$$\mathcal{T}^{\mu\nu}_{(0)} = 2\tilde{\Delta}^{\langle\mu}_{\alpha}\tilde{\Delta}^{\nu\rangle}_{\beta} \int_{0}^{\infty} dp^{0} \int d^{4}y e^{ip \cdot y} \langle V^{\alpha}(x_{-})V^{\beta}(x_{+})\rangle = 2\tilde{\Delta}^{\langle\mu}_{\alpha}\tilde{\Delta}^{\nu\rangle}_{\beta} \int_{0}^{\infty} dp^{0}n(p^{0})A^{\alpha\beta}(p)$$

The spectral function $\Delta_L^{\mu\nu} = v^{\mu}v^{\nu}/(-v^2), \ \Delta_T^{\mu\nu} = \Delta^{\mu\nu} - \Delta_L^{\mu\nu}, \ \tilde{v}^{\mu} = \tilde{\Delta}^{\mu\nu}u_{\nu}$

$$A^{\mu\nu} = \sum_{a=L,T} \Delta_a^{\mu\nu} A_a, \ A_a = \frac{1}{\pi} \text{Im} \ \frac{-1}{p^2 - m^2 - \Pi_a}.$$

The result

1st order–linear response theorem

Linear response (like those for calculate η/s)

$$V_{+(1)}^{\mu\nu} = \varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}} \lim_{\nu, q \to 0} \frac{\partial}{\partial \nu} \left[-\mathrm{Im} G_{R+}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu, \boldsymbol{q}, \boldsymbol{p}) \right] \xi_{\lambda\gamma}$$

$$\xi_{\lambda\gamma} \equiv \beta^{-1} \partial_{(\lambda} (\beta u)_{\gamma)}$$
$$\approx \sigma_{\lambda\gamma} + \left[\frac{1}{3} \bar{\Delta}_{\lambda\gamma} + c_s^2 u_\lambda u_\gamma \right] \theta$$

The green function is connected to energy momentum tensor

$$\begin{array}{c} G_R^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu,\boldsymbol{q},\boldsymbol{p}) & \text{Wigner Trans} \\ T^{\mu\nu} \equiv -F^{\mu}_{\ \alpha}F^{\nu\alpha} + m^2V^{\mu}V^{\nu} - \eta^{\mu\nu}\left(-F^2/4 + m^2V^2/2\right) \end{array} \\ \end{array}$$

One skeleton/dressed loop calculation with spectral functions

$$G_{R+}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu,\boldsymbol{q},\boldsymbol{p}) = -\int_0^\infty dk_0 \int_0^\infty dk_0' \frac{n(k_0') - n(k_0)}{\nu + k_0' - k_0 + i0^+} \times \sum_{a,b=L,T} A_a(k) A_b(k') I_{ab}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(k,k') \,.$$



In-medium interactions are implicitly included in self-energies!

1st order–linear response theorem

Linear response (like those for calculate η/s) $W_{+(1)}^{\mu\nu} = \varepsilon_{p} \lim_{\nu, a \to 0} \frac{\partial}{\partial \nu} [-\mathrm{Im} G_{R+}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu, q, p)] \xi_{\lambda\gamma}$

$$\xi_{\lambda\gamma} \equiv \beta^{-1} \partial_{(\lambda} (\beta u)_{\gamma)}$$
$$\approx \sigma_{\lambda\gamma} + \left[\frac{1}{3} \bar{\Delta}_{\lambda\gamma} + c_s^2 u_\lambda u_\gamma \right] \theta$$

The green function is connected to energy momentum tensor

$$G_R^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu,\boldsymbol{q},\boldsymbol{p}) \qquad \text{Wigner Trans} \quad (-i)\Theta(t-t')\langle [V^{\mu}(t,\boldsymbol{x}^-)V^{\nu}(t,\boldsymbol{x}^+),T^{\lambda\gamma}(t',\boldsymbol{z})]\rangle,$$

$$T^{\mu\nu} \equiv -F^{\mu}_{\ \alpha}F^{\nu\alpha} + m^2V^{\mu}V^{\nu} - \eta^{\mu\nu}\left(-F^2/4 + m^2V^2/2\right) \qquad \text{+ higher order terms}$$

One skeleton/dressed loop calculation with spectral functions

$$G_{R+}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu,\boldsymbol{q},\boldsymbol{p}) = -\int_{0}^{\infty} dk_{0} \int_{0}^{\infty} dk'_{0} \frac{n(k'_{0}) - n(k_{0})}{\nu + k'_{0} - k_{0} + i0^{+}} \times \sum_{a,b=L,T} A_{a}(k)A_{b}(k')I_{ab}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(k,k') .$$
higher orders
neglected here
higher orders
neglected here
higher orders
higher o

1st order–linear response theorem

Linear response (like those for calculate η/s)

$$W_{+(1)}^{\mu\nu} = \varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}} \lim_{\nu,q\to 0} \frac{\partial}{\partial\nu} [-\mathrm{Im}G_{R+}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu,\boldsymbol{q},\boldsymbol{p})]\xi_{\lambda\gamma}$$

$$\xi_{\lambda\gamma} \equiv \beta^{-1} \partial_{(\lambda} (\beta u)_{\gamma)}$$
$$\approx \sigma_{\lambda\gamma} + \left[\frac{1}{3} \bar{\Delta}_{\lambda\gamma} + c_s^2 u_\lambda u_\gamma \right] \theta$$

The green function is connected to energy momentum tensor

$$G_R^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu,\boldsymbol{q},\boldsymbol{p}) \qquad \text{Wigner Trans} \quad (-i)\Theta(t-t')\langle [V^{\mu}(t,\boldsymbol{x}^-)V^{\nu}(t,\boldsymbol{x}^+),T^{\lambda\gamma}(t',\boldsymbol{z})]\rangle,$$
$$T^{\mu\nu} \equiv -F^{\mu}_{\ \alpha}F^{\nu\alpha} + m^2V^{\mu}V^{\nu} - \eta^{\mu\nu}\left(-F^2/4 + m^2V^2/2\right)$$

One skeleton/dressed loop calculation with spectral functions

$$G_{R+}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(\nu,\boldsymbol{q},\boldsymbol{p}) = -\int_0^\infty dk_0 \int_0^\infty dk_0' \frac{n(k_0') - n(k_0)}{\nu + k_0' - k_0 + i0^+} \times \sum_{a,b=L,T} A_a(k) A_b(k') I_{ab}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(k,k') \,.$$

• With some calculation: $I_{ab}^{\mu\nu\lambda\gamma}(k,k') = [k^{\lambda}k'^{\gamma} + k^{\gamma}k'^{\lambda}]\Delta_{a}^{\nu\alpha}(k)\Delta_{b,\alpha}^{\mu}(k')$



$$- \begin{bmatrix} k_{\alpha}k^{\prime\gamma}\Delta_{a}^{\nu\lambda}(k)\Delta_{b}^{\mu\alpha}(k^{\prime}) + k^{\gamma}k_{\alpha}^{\prime}\Delta_{a}^{\nu\alpha}(k)\Delta_{b}^{\mu\lambda}(k^{\prime}) \end{bmatrix} \\ - \begin{bmatrix} k^{\lambda}k_{\alpha}^{\prime}\Delta_{a}^{\nu\alpha}(k)\Delta_{b}^{\mu\gamma}(k^{\prime}) + k_{\alpha}k^{\prime\lambda}\Delta_{a}^{\nu\gamma}(k)\Delta_{b}^{\mu\alpha}(k^{\prime}) \end{bmatrix} \\ + (k_{\alpha}k^{\prime\alpha} - m^{2})[\Delta_{a}^{\nu\lambda}(k)\Delta_{b}^{\mu\gamma}(k^{\prime}) + \Delta_{a}^{\nu\gamma}(k)\Delta_{b}^{\mu\lambda}(k^{\prime})] \\ - \eta^{\gamma\lambda}[(k^{\zeta}k_{\zeta}^{\prime} - m^{2})\eta_{\alpha\beta} - k_{\beta}k_{\alpha}^{\prime}]\Delta_{a}^{\nu\alpha}(k)\Delta_{b}^{\mu\beta}(k^{\prime})] \end{bmatrix}$$

Compact results for 1st order

A one-line formula for tensor polarization

$$\mathcal{T}_{(1)}^{\mu\nu} = \beta n(\varepsilon_{\mathbf{p}}) \tilde{\Delta}_{\lambda}^{\langle\mu} \tilde{\Delta}_{\gamma}^{\nu\rangle} \left[\alpha_{\rm sh} \xi^{\gamma\lambda} + \alpha_{\rm sp} \xi_{p} \frac{u^{\lambda} u^{\gamma}}{-\tilde{v}^{2}} \right]$$

with coefficient

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_{\rm sh} = & \frac{4\varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}}\pi}{\beta n(\varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}})} \int_0^\infty \frac{\partial n(\omega)}{\partial \omega} d\omega (\omega^2 - \varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}}^2) A_{T/L}^2(\omega, \boldsymbol{p}) \\ \alpha_{\rm sp} = & \frac{4\varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}}\pi}{\beta n(\varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}})} \int_0^\infty \frac{\partial n(\omega)}{\partial \omega} d\omega \varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}}^2 (A_T^2(\omega, \boldsymbol{p}) - A_L^2(\omega, \boldsymbol{p})) \end{aligned}$$

in quasi-particle spectral function $A_a(\omega, \mathbf{p}) \approx \frac{1}{2\varepsilon_p} \frac{1}{\pi} \text{Im} \frac{-1}{\omega - \omega_p^a + i\Gamma_p^a/2}$ $\alpha_{\text{sh}} \approx -\frac{2\Delta\varepsilon_p}{\Gamma_p} + 2\frac{\Delta\varepsilon_p}{\Gamma_p} \frac{\Delta\varepsilon_p}{T} + \frac{\Gamma_p}{2T} \sim \mathcal{O}(1)$

T-odd, dissipative

$$\alpha_{\rm sp} \approx -\frac{\varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}}}{\Gamma_{\boldsymbol{p}}} \left(\frac{\Gamma_{\boldsymbol{p}}^{\Delta}}{\Gamma_{\boldsymbol{p}}} - \frac{\Delta \varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}}}{T} \frac{\Gamma_{\boldsymbol{p}}^{\Delta}}{\Gamma_{\boldsymbol{p}}} + \frac{\Gamma_{\boldsymbol{p}}}{T} \frac{\omega_{\boldsymbol{p}}^{\Delta}}{\Gamma_{\boldsymbol{p}}} \right) \sim \mathcal{O}(\delta_{\rm qp}^{-1} \delta_{\rm sp}).$$

Width Γ_p , energy/mass-shift $\Delta \varepsilon_p$, split of width Γ_p^{Δ} and energy ω_p^{Δ} Well-defined old players in thermal field theory, no extra new players are required

Total Theory Results

$$\kappa_{0}^{u} = \frac{\alpha_{0}}{-\tilde{v}^{2}}n_{0}, \quad \kappa_{1}^{u} = \left[\alpha_{\rm sh}\left(c_{s}^{2} - \frac{1}{3}\right)\theta + \frac{\alpha_{\rm sp}\varsigma_{p}}{-\tilde{v}^{2}}\right]\beta n_{0} \qquad \alpha_{\rm sh} \approx -\frac{1}{\Gamma_{p}} + 2\frac{1}{\Gamma_{p}}\frac{1}{T} + \frac{1}{2T} \sim O(1)$$

$$\kappa_{\rm sh} = \alpha_{\rm sh}\beta n_{0}, \quad \kappa_{T} = 0, \quad \kappa_{\rm su} = 0, \quad \kappa_{\rm ou} = 0 \qquad \alpha_{\rm sp} \approx -\frac{\varepsilon_{p}}{\Gamma_{p}}\left(\frac{\Gamma_{p}^{\Delta}}{\Gamma_{p}} - \frac{\Delta\varepsilon_{p}}{T}\frac{\Gamma_{p}^{\Delta}}{\Gamma_{p}} + \frac{\Gamma_{p}}{T}\frac{\omega_{p}^{\Delta}}{\Gamma_{p}}\right) \sim O(\delta_{\rm qp}^{-1}\delta_{\rm sp}).$$
Features of the result
$$\alpha_{0} \approx (\omega_{p}^{T} - \omega_{p}^{L})/T \qquad \text{Nonanalytical energy-shift} \text{more subtle}$$

- Natural, suggested by symmetry, verified in concrete thermal field theory calculation, all have been done is a more careful theory study with more realistic spectral functions
- Universal, SITP exist in all spin-1 particles including heavy quarkonium, in relativistic or non-relativistic (SITP has a coefficient have no mass suppression)

Outline

- 1) Spin Observables in Heavy-ion Collisions
- 2) Theory for Tensor Polarization and Spin Alignment
- 3) Spectral properties of in-medium mesonic resonance
- 4) Phenomenology implications
- 5) Summary and outlooks

Spectral properties of in-medium degree of freedom

- Where the mesons of freedom forms?
 - Chemical freezeout
 - Late stage of QGP?

Towards the Theory of Binary Bound States in Quark-Gluon Plasma

Shuryak, Zahed, PRD 2004

Edward V.Shuryak and Ismail Zahed

♦ Large confining potential \iff mesonic resonance at $T \sim 0.2$ GeV



Spectral properties of in-medium degree of freedom

Where the mesons of freedom forms?

- Chemical freezeout
- Late stage of QGP?

Towards the Theory of Binary Bound States in Quark-Gluon Plasma

Shuryak, Zahed, PRD 2004

Edward V.Shuryak and Ismail Zahed

 $Large confining potential \implies$ mesonic resonance at $T \sim 0.2$ GeV



Rich physics in spectral functions



Outline

- 1) Spins Observables in Heavy-ion Collisions
- 2) Theory for Tensor Polarization and Spin Alignment
- 3) Spectral properties of in-medium mesonic resonance
- 4) Phenomenology implications
- 5) Summary and outlooks

Phenomenology implication







Large phenomenologically, especially SITP can generate ~1% level spin alignment at the relatively late stage of QGP phase

Using spectral functions with *p*, T(many others) species dependence, can include
 Rich physics that may help in understand rich structures observed in experiment

Summary

- Discovered a Shear-Induced Tensor Polarization(SITP), together with other new 0th and 1st order effects
- *Natural, allowed by the symmetry and verified in calculation
- ***Universal**, SITP exist in all interacting many-body system with spin-1 particle, in relativistic/non-relativistic scenarios.
- ★Large and Rich, effects especially SITP can contribute to spin alignment at the order of ~1% level, promising to include rich physics with more realistic spectral functions.

Standard many-body interactions (such as collisions) can lead to large spin alignment with the discovery of the missing new effects, such as SITP!

Many works need to be done to make quantitative predictions, due to the rich physics and complexity in strongly coupled many-body system