



## **Highlights on the XYZ Physics**

Frank Nerling HFHF, GSI & GU Frankfurt

Celebration Ceremony of the 500 Publications of BESIII Collaboration, May 31<sup>st</sup> 2023, IHEP, Beijing, China

#### <u>Outline</u>

- Introduction
- The BESIII experiments and data sets
- A selection of recent results
  - Supernumerary vector Y states
  - Manifestly exotic Z<sub>c</sub> states
  - The X(3872) and other X states
- Summary





### **Recent hot topics**



#### Hadron Spectroscopy



#### Strange partner of the famous, unexpected, manifestly exotic Z<sub>c</sub>(3900)?



### **Recent hot topics**



#### Hadron Spectroscopy



#### Strange partner of the famous, unexpected, manifestly exotic Z<sub>c</sub>(3900)?





## **Charmonium spectrum (cc̄)**





#### **Potential model:**

$$\begin{split} V_0^{c\overline{c}} &= -\frac{4}{3}\frac{\alpha_s}{r} + br + \frac{32\pi\alpha_s}{9m_c^2}\delta(r)\vec{S}_c\vec{S}_{\overline{c}}\\ V_{\text{spin-dep.}} &= \frac{1}{m_c^2}\left[\left(\frac{2\alpha_s}{r^3} - \frac{b}{2r}\right)\vec{L}\cdot\vec{S} + \frac{4\alpha_s}{r^3}T\right]\\ &+ \text{ relativistic corrections!} \end{split}$$

c

c

[Godfrey & Isgur, PRD 32 (1985) 189] [Barnes, Godfrey & Swanson, PRD 72 (2005) 054026]

Frank Nerling



## **Charmonium spectrum (cc̄)**





#### • Before 2003:

Good agreement between theory and experiment, particularly beneath open charm thresholds



$$\begin{split} V_0^{c\overline{c}} &= -\frac{4}{3}\frac{\alpha_s}{r} + br + \frac{32\pi\alpha_s}{9m_c^2}\delta(r)\vec{S}_c\vec{S}_{\overline{c}}\\ V_{\text{spin-dep.}} &= \frac{1}{m_c^2}\left[\left(\frac{2\alpha_s}{r^3} - \frac{b}{2r}\right)\vec{L}\cdot\vec{S} + \frac{4\alpha_s}{r^3}T\right]\\ &+ \text{ relativistic corrections!} \end{split}$$

[Godfrey & Isgur, PRD 32 (1985) 189] [Barnes, Godfrey & Swanson, PRD 72 (2005) 054026]





## **Charmonium spectrum (cc)**





#### • Before 2003:

- Good agreement between theory and experiment, particularly beneath open charm thresholds
- After 2003:
  - Severe mismatch between predicted and observed spectrum

#### Potential model:

$$\begin{split} V_0^{c\overline{c}} &= -\frac{4}{3}\frac{\alpha_s}{r} + br + \frac{32\pi\alpha_s}{9m_c^2}\delta(r)\vec{S}_c\vec{S}_{\overline{c}}\\ V_{\rm spin-dep.} &= \frac{1}{m_c^2}\left[\left(\frac{2\alpha_s}{r^3} - \frac{b}{2r}\right)\vec{L}\cdot\vec{S} + \frac{4\alpha_s}{r^3}T\right]\\ &+ \text{ relativistic corrections!} \end{split}$$

[Godfrey & Isgur, PRD 32 (1985) 189] [Barnes, Godfrey & Swanson, PRD 72 (2005) 054026]





## **Charmonium spectrum (cc̄)**







## **Charmonium spectrum (cc)**







## **Charmonium spectrum (cc)**









#### Simple Quark model

• Mesons: Color neutral  $q\overline{q}$  systems



Conventional (qq)

#### QCD

Meson states beyond qq





## **BESIII at BEPCII**





- Symmetric e<sup>+</sup>e<sup>-</sup> collider:
  - √s = 2.0 4.6 GeV
- Design luminosity:
  - 1x10<sup>33</sup> cm<sup>-2</sup>s<sup>-1</sup> (at ψ(3770), achieved in 04/2016)

- Multi-purpose  $4\pi$  detector with
  - good tracking
  - calorimetry
  - PID and muon detection
- Operating since March 2008



### Unique BESIII data set (collected so far ...)









# The Y(4260) and further supernumerary vector states





Some history:



- Discovery of the Y(4260) using ISR by BaBar in  $J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-$
- Discovery of the Y(4360) using ISR by BaBar in  $\psi(2s)\pi^+\pi^-$





BESIII result, published



- Cross-section inconsistent with the single resonance Y(4260)!
  - > Two favoured over one by >7 $\sigma$

- BESIII: Much higher precision (5.8σ)
- Coherent BW fit: Y(4230) and Y(4360)





BESIII result, published



- Cross-section inconsistent with the single resonance Y(4260)
  - Additional structure at ~4.5 GeV needed (?), influences Y(4230) parameters

• BESIII: Much higher precision  $(5.8\sigma)$ 

Coherent BW fit: Y(4230) and Y(4360)

## What happened to the Y states?





Two structures now resolved:  $Y(4260) \rightarrow Y(4230)$ , and Y(4360)

₿€SШ



## What happened to the Y states?

- BESIII

- Belle

- BaBar

4.5

√s(GeV)

4.6









Y(4230):

> M = (4228.6 ± 4.1 ± 6.3) MeV/c<sup>2</sup> >  $\Gamma$  = (77.0 ± 6.8 ± 6.3) MeV/c<sup>2</sup>

#### Y state at about 4.40 GeV:

- strongly model dependent
- => First Y decays to open-charm
- => Consistency with structures in J/ $\psi$  / h<sub>c</sub> /  $\psi$ (2S)  $\pi\pi$







- BESIII: Much higher precision (5.8 $\sigma$ )
- Coherent BW fit: Y(4230) and Y(4360)
- Confirmation of the Y(4360) in  $\psi(2S)\pi^{-}\pi^{+}$  with a significance of 8 $\sigma$
- First observation of Y(4660) with 5.8σ





 $e^+e^- \to \psi(2S)\pi^+\pi^-$ 



- BESIII: Much higher precision  $(5.8\sigma)$
- Coherent BW fit: Y(4230) and Y(4360)

 $e^+e^- \rightarrow \psi(2S)\pi^+\pi^-$ 



- Observation of Y(4660)  $\rightarrow \psi(2S)\pi^{-}\pi^{+}$  with a significance of 8.1 $\sigma$
- First observation of Y(4660) at BESIII

## **BESI** What about Y states to open charm?













Y(4230):

> M =  $(4228.6 \pm 4.1 \pm 6.3) \text{ MeV/c}^2$ >  $\Gamma = (77.0 \pm 6.8 \pm 6.3) \text{ MeV/c}^2$ 

Y state at about 4.40 GeV:

- strongly model dependent
- => First Y decays to open-charm
- => Consistency with structures in J/ $\psi$  / h<sub>c</sub> /  $\psi$ (2S)  $\pi\pi$



## What happened to the Y states?





E<sub>CM</sub>(GeV)

#### Y(4230):

- $\blacktriangleright$  M = (4209.6 ±4.7 ±5.9) MeV/c<sup>2</sup>
- $\succ$   $\Gamma = (81.6 \pm 17.8 \pm 9.0) \text{ MeV}$

#### Y(4500):

- $\blacktriangleright$  M = (4469.1 ± 26.2 ± 3.6) MeV/c<sup>2</sup>
- $\succ$   $\Gamma = (81.6 \pm 17.8 \pm 9.0)$  MeV

#### Y(4660):

- $\blacktriangleright$  M = (4675.3 ±29.5±3.5) MeV/c<sup>2</sup>
- $\succ$   $\Gamma = (218.2 \pm 72.9 \pm 9.3)$  MeV
  - => Consistency with structures in  $J/\psi / h_c / \psi(2S)\pi\pi \& J/\psi KK$

#### Y(4230):

- $\blacktriangleright$  M = (4228.6 ± 4.1 ± 6.3) MeV/c<sup>2</sup>
- $\succ$   $\Gamma = (77.0 \pm 6.8 \pm 6.3) \text{ MeV/c}^2$

#### Y state at about 4.40 GeV:

- strongly model dependent
- => First Y decays to open-charm
- => Consistency with structures in  $J/\psi / h_c / \psi(2S) \pi \pi$



# The Y states, e<sup>+</sup>e<sup>-</sup> production of J/ $\psi\pi\pi$ , h<sub>c</sub> $\pi\pi$ , $\psi(2S)\pi\pi$ and J/ $\psi$ K<sup>+</sup>K<sup>-</sup>





- Dressed cross-section measurement of  $e^+e^- \to \, K^+K^- \, J/\psi$
- Y(4230) and Y(4500) observed (29σ / 8σ)
   M = (4484.7 ± 13.3 ± 24.1) MeV/c<sup>2</sup>
   Γ = (77.0 ± 6.8 ± 6.3) MeV







# The Y states, e<sup>+</sup>e<sup>-</sup> production of J/ψ $\pi\pi$ , h<sub>c</sub> $\pi\pi$ , ψ(2S) $\pi\pi$ and J/ψK<sub>s</sub>K<sub>s</sub>



- Data samples from 4.13 to 4.95 GeV (21.2 fb<sup>-1</sup>)
- Dressed cross-section measurement of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow K_s^{\ 0}K_s^{\ 0} \ J/\psi$



- Evidence for  $Y(4710) \rightarrow K_s^{\ 0}K_s^{\ 0} J/\psi$  (4.0 $\sigma$ ) >  $M = (4704.0 \pm 52.3 \pm 69.5) \text{ MeV/c}^2$ 
  - $\Gamma = (183.2 \pm 114.0 \pm 96.1) \text{ MeV}$
- Y(4230)  $\rightarrow K_s^{\ 0}K_s^{\ 0} J/\psi$  observed for the first time (26 $\sigma$ )





### The (charged) Zc states

## **EXAMPLE SILE** Two Z<sub>c</sub> triplets established at BESIII



• Two isospin triplets of charmonium-like exotic states established

UNIVERSITÄ

## **Here a stablished at BESIII Two Z<sub>c</sub> triplets established at BESIII**



- Two isospin triplets of charmonium-like exotic states established
- Different decay modes (hidden vs. open charm) of same state observed?

## **EVALUATE:** First Z<sub>cs</sub> candidates Z(3985) reported





- Search for strange partner of  $Z_c(3900)$ 
  - ➤ Containing s quark in open charm decay >  $e^+e^- \rightarrow K^+(D_sD^*/D_s^*D)^-$
  - > Narrow threshold enhancement (5.3 $\sigma$ )

$$M = (3982.5^{+1.8}_{-2.6} \pm 2.1) \text{MeV}/c^2, \Gamma = (12.8^{+5.3}_{-4.4} \pm 3.0) \text{MeV}$$

- Manifestly exotic charged hidden-charm tetraquark candidate with strangeness
  - With a non-zero electric charge
  - Thus, minimal quark content => [ccsu]
- LHCb reports a  $Z_{cs}(4000)$  in B  $\rightarrow \phi(J/\psi K^+)$ >  $M = (4000.3 \pm 6^{+4}_{-14}) MeV/c^2,$   $\Gamma = (131 \pm 15 \pm 26) MeV$ 
  - >  $J^{P} = 1^{+}$ , hidden charm final state
  - > 10x broader ...
- => Same state observed in different decays (open/hidden charm) at two experiments?

## **EXEMINATE SET UP:** First Z<sub>cs</sub> candidates Z(3985) reported



- Search for strange partner of  $Z_c(3900)$ 
  - ➤ Containing s quark in open charm decay >  $e^+e^- \rightarrow K^+(D_sD^*/D_s^*D)^-$
  - > Narrow threshold enhancement (5.3 $\sigma$ )

$$M = (3982.5^{+1.8}_{-2.6} \pm 2.1) \text{MeV}/c^2, \Gamma = (12.8^{+5.3}_{-4.4} \pm 3.0) \text{MeV}$$

- Manifestly exotic charged hidden-charm tetraquark candidate with strangeness
  - With a non-zero electric charge
  - > Thus, minimal quark content => [ccsu]
- Search for neutral partner of  $Z_{cs}(3985)$ 
  - Containing s quark in open charm decay

$$e^+e^- \to K^0_{\rm S}(D^+_s D^{*-} + D^{*+}_s D^-)$$

> Narrow threshold enhancement (4.6 $\sigma$ )

$$M = (3992.2 \pm 1.7 \pm 1.6) \text{ MeV}/c^2$$
  

$$\Gamma = (7.7^{+4.1}_{-3.8} \pm 4.3) \text{ MeV}$$

=> Seem to be isospinpartners



## The charged Z<sub>cs</sub>'





- Search for excited partner of  $Z_{cs}(3985)$ 
  - > 3 different data samples at  $\sqrt{s} = 4.661$ , 4.682 and 4.699 GeV (2.7 fb<sup>-1</sup>)
  - $\blacktriangleright e^+e^- \rightarrow K^+D_s^{*-}D^{*0} + c.c.$
  - two different tag-methods (D<sub>s</sub><sup>-</sup>-/D<sup>\*0</sup>-tags)
- Evidence for a  $Z_{cs}$  state >  $M = (4123.5 \pm 0.7) MeV/c^2$ 
  - > 2.1 $\sigma$  significance (3.9 $\sigma$  \wo systematics)
- Statistics limited, test of decay width hypotheses, local statistical 4.1 $\sigma$  for:  $(M_0, \Gamma_0) = (4124.1 MeV/c^2, 10 MeV)$
- Upper Limits (CL90) provided: on σ<sub>Born</sub> x BR: *O*(1) pb
  - > UL on  $\sigma_{Born} x BR$ : : O(1) pb
  - > at each  $\sqrt{s}$  = 4.661, 4.682 and 4.699
  - => More data will be taken





### The X(3872) and further X states

## SII Experimental review of the X(3872)





#### Analogy to deuteron:



- First observed by Belle in 2003
  - $\succ X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi \pi^+ \pi^-$
  - very narrow state with J<sup>PC</sup> = 1<sup>++</sup>
- Belle & BaBar report signal in >  $X(3872) \rightarrow D^0 \bar{D}^{*0}$
- Mass  $m[X(3872)] m[D^{*0}] m[D^0]$ = (-0.07 ± 0.12) MeV/c<sup>2</sup> (LHCb 2020)
- Width measurement:
  - ≻ Γ<sub>X(3872)</sub> < 1.2 MeV (2011, Belle)</p>
  - ➤ Γ<sub>X(3872)</sub> = 1.13 MeV (2020, LHCb)

For clarification: => Precision measurement with

sub-MeV resolution needed!

## **EESI** First observation of $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma X(3872)$



BESIII: First observation of 
$$e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma X(3872) \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+\pi^- J/\psi$$
  
First observation of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma X(3872) \rightarrow \gamma \omega J/\psi$ 



- $m = (3871.9 \pm 0.7 \pm 0.2) \,\mathrm{MeV}/c^2$
- $\Gamma < 2.4 \,\mathrm{MeV}$  (90% CL)

• Fit with three Breit-Wigner resonances => Evidence for two more structures

## **ESI** First observation of $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma X(3872)$





- $m = (4200.6^{+7.9}_{-13.3} \pm 3.0) \text{ MeV}/c^2$
- $\Gamma = (115^{+38}_{-26} \pm 12) \text{ MeV}/c^2$

 Shape consistent with production via a Y(4260) state

[Subm. to Phys. Rev. Lett., arXiv:1903.04695 [hep-ex]]



Study of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma \phi J/\psi$ 









- BESIII successfully operating since 2008
  - World largest data sets in tau-charm mass region, unique XYZ data
  - > Recent machine upgrade extends studies up to  $E_{cms} = ~4.9 \text{ GeV}$
- BESIII successfully operating since 2008
  - Supernumerary vector Y states consistently resolved (statistics)
    - Y(4260) and Y(4360) → Y(4230), Y(4360)
    - First decays to open charm, further new decay modes to cc and/or light hadrons investigated
    - More candidates reported, especially Y(4500), Y(4710), and Y(4660)
  - $\succ$  Charged Z<sub>c</sub> states are manifestly exotic states
    - First complete isospin triplets established
    - First strange partner(s) reported, isospin triplet Z<sub>cs</sub>(3895)
  - > The first of these states discovered, the X(3872) still not understood
    - Line shape to be measured precisely
    - X(4140, ), X(4274), X(4500)  $\rightarrow \phi J/\psi$  not seen
- Next machine upgrade planned (summer 2024) => E<sub>cms</sub> > 5GeV



### **Summary and Prospectives**



- BESIII successfully operating since 2008
  - World largest data sets in tau-charm mass region, unique XYZ data
  - > Recent machine upgrade extends studies up to  $E_{cms} = ~4.9 \text{ GeV}$
- BESIII successfully operating since 2008
  - Supernumerary vector Y states consistently resolved (sta Thank you!
    - Y(4260) and Y(4360) → Y(4230), Y(4360)





### **Summary and Prospectives**







**BEPCII Upgrade** (higher luminosity at higher energies)





- Machine upgrade: 2 new cavities (RF), higher currents
- Higher luminosities at higher energies, e.g. factor ~3 at 2.3 GeV
- After shutdown collect more XYZ data at 4.6 5.5 GeV



Study of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma \phi J/\psi$ 



 $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma \phi \chi_{c2}$ 



- Cross section measurement:  $e^+e^- 
  ightarrow \phi \chi_{c2}$
- Evidence for Y(4660)  $\rightarrow \phi \chi_{c2}$
- Statistical significance of  $3.1\sigma$
- No signal for Y(4660)  $\rightarrow \phi \chi_{c1}$
- Different fit models:
  - Single BW model (red line)

 $M = (4672.8 \pm 10.8 \pm 3.9) \text{ MeV}/c^2$  $\Gamma = (93.2 \pm 19.8 \pm 9.4) \text{ MeV}$ 



### New production processes of X(3872)



#### **Production mechanisms**

- B meson decays (discovery by Belle, 2003)
- Radiative transitions (e.g. from Y(4230), BESIII)
- Prompt production (e.g. pp collisions, e.g. CMS)
- Two-photon fusion (evidence by Belle, 2021)





#### Two-photon fusion at BESIII

- VMD prediction: Γ<sub>ee</sub> ≥ 0.036 eV [A.Denig et al. PLB 736 (2014) 221]
- After observation (5.1 $\sigma$ ) of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \chi_{c1}$ [BESIII, PRL 129 (2022) 122001]
- Search for  $e^+e^- \rightarrow X(3872)$ 
  - No enhancment observed in cross section
  - > Provide UL(CL90) assuming average value:  $\Gamma_{tot} = 1.19 \text{ MeV}$

$$\Rightarrow \quad \frac{\Gamma_{ee} \times \mathcal{B} < 7.5 \times 10^{-3} \text{ eV}}{\Gamma_{ee}(X(3872)) < 0.32 \text{ eV}}$$



Observation of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \omega X(3872)$ 



- 9 data samples from 4.66 to 4.95 GeV (4.7 fb<sup>-1</sup>)
- First observation of this production process  $\rightarrow$  just above threshold



- $m = (3871.9 \pm 0.7 \pm 0.2) \text{ MeV}/c^2$   $\Gamma < 2.4 \text{ MeV}$  (90% CL)
- $\Gamma < 2.4 \,\mathrm{MeV}$



X(3872) and  $\omega$  signal regions

## **EFSI** First observation of $X(3872) \rightarrow \chi_{c1}\pi^0$





• No significant signals were found by Belle in search for X(3872) and X(3915) to  $\chi_{c0} \pi^0$  (0.3 $\sigma$  / 2.3 $\sigma$ )

 $> \mathcal{B}(X(3872) \rightarrow \chi_{c1}\pi^0)/\mathcal{B}(X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-) < 0.97 (90\% \text{ C.L.})$ 

- BESIII observes now X(3872) decay to  $\chi_{c0} \pi^0$  (> 5 $\sigma$ )
  - >  $\mathcal{B}(X(3872) \to \chi_{c1}\pi^0)/\mathcal{B}(X(3872) \to J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-) = 0.88^{+0.33}_{-0.27} \pm 0.10.$

Isospin violation, comparable decay rate to  $J/\psi\rho$ => Disfavours  $\chi_{c1}(2P)$ 



## Further decays of Y(4260)





Frank Nerling



## Further decays of Y(4260)



 $e^+e^- \rightarrow J/\psi \eta$ 



- Simultaneous maximum-likelihood fit (Top: High stat. XYZ data, Bottom: Scan data)
- $\psi(4040)$  assumed, Y(4220), Y(4390) ?
- Significance of Y(4390) = 6.0  $\sigma$
- Y(4220) & Y(4390) mass and width compilation vs. Y(4360) from PDG:



## **Hereford With States and Second States (1997) "Y(4260)" in different decay channels**



$\sim c\overline{c} \text{ MESONS} > \psi(4230) > \psi(4230) \text{ MASS}$							
	$\psi(4230)$ MASS						NSPIR
	VALUE (MeV)	EVTS	DOCUMENT ID		TECN	COMMENT	
	$\textbf{4222.7} \pm \textbf{2.6}$	OUR AVERAGE Error includes scale	factor of 1.7. See th	e ideogra	m below.		
	$4234.4 \pm \! 3.2 \pm \! 0.2$		<sup>1</sup> ABLIKIM	2021AJ	BES3	$e^+  e^-  ightarrow \pi^+ \pi^- \psi(2S)$	
	$4216.7 \pm \! 8.9 \pm \! 4.1$		<sup>2</sup> ABLIKIM	2020AG	BES3	$e^+ \; e^-  ightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$	
	$4220.4 \pm \! 2.4 \pm \! 2.3$		<sup>3</sup> ABLIKIM	2020N	BES3	$e^+  e^-  ightarrow \pi^0 \pi^0 J/\psi$	
	$4218.6 \pm 3.8 \pm 2.5$		<sup>3</sup> ABLIKIM	20200	BES3	$e^+ \; e^-  o \eta J/\psi$	
	$4218.5 \pm \! 1.6 \pm \! 4.0$		<sup>4</sup> ABLIKIM	2019AI	BES3	$e^+ \; e^-  ightarrow \omega \chi_{c0}$	
	$4228.6 \pm \!$		ABLIKIM	2019R	BES3	$e^+~e^-  ightarrow \pi^+ D^0 D^{*-}$ + c.c.	
	$4200.6 \ {}^{+7.9}_{-13.3} \pm 3.0$		<sup>5</sup> ABLIKIM	2019V	BES3	$e^+ \; e^-  ightarrow \gamma \chi_{c1}(3872)$	
	$4222.0 \pm 3.1 \pm 1.4$		<sup>6</sup> ABLIKIM	2017B	BES3	$e^+ \; e^-  ightarrow \pi^+ \pi^- J/\psi$	
	$4218 \ _{-4.5}^{+5.5} \pm 0.9$		ABLIKIM	2017G	BES3	$e^+  e^-  ightarrow \pi^+ \pi^- h_c$	

PDG calls the narrow structure meanwhile  $\psi(4230)$  — seen in many different decay modes, mainly charmonium + light meson(s)

# **BESIT** Vector states: Hidden-charm production

• different channels show (slightly) different masses and widths



• coupled channel studies are needed!

PDG calls the narrow structure meanwhile  $\psi(4230)$  — seen in many different decay modes, mainly charmonium + light meson(s)