## Relativistic Corrections to Electromagnetic Heavy Quarkonium Production

## Wen Chen（IHEP）

In collaboration with
y．Jia（IHEP），
N．Brambilla，V．Shtabovenko，and A．Vairo（TUM）

中国物理学会高能物理分会第十二届全国粒子物理学术会议
Aug．24，2016，at USTC ，Heifei
$>$ Motivation
> NRQCD factorization
$>$ Charmonium production

- Charmonium decay
> Summary
- Heavy quarkonia probe all the energy regimes of QCD, and are thus an ideal, and to some extent, unique laboratory to test our understanding of QCD (both perturbative and nonperturbative aspects). (Brambilla et al., 2005).
- NRQCD provides an elegant approach to separate relativistic physics of annihilation from the nonrelativistic physics of quarkonium structure; (BBL, 1995)
- Large discrepancies are found between leading order (LO) theoretical prediction and the experimental measurements for the process $e^{+} e^{-} \rightarrow J / \Psi+H$ at B-factory, Belle, and BaBar. (Brambilla, et al., 2011)

|  | $J / \psi+\eta_{c}$ | $J / \psi+\chi_{c 0}$ | $J / \psi+\eta_{c}(2 S)$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\sigma \times B_{>2}$ (fb) (Belle) | $25.6 \pm 2.8 \pm 3.4$ | $6.4 \pm 1.7 \pm 1.0$ | $16.5 \pm 3.0 \pm 2.4$ |
| $\sigma \times B_{>2}(\mathrm{fb})($ BABAR $)$ | $17.6 \pm 2.8_{-2.1}^{+1.5}$ | $10.3 \pm 2.5_{-1.8}^{+1.4}$ | $16.4 \pm 3.7_{-3.0}^{+2.4}$ |
| $\sigma(\mathrm{fb})($ Liu, He, Chao) | 5.5 | 6.9 | 3.7 |
| $\sigma(\mathrm{fb})($ Braaten, Lee) | $3.78 \pm 1.26$ | $2.40 \pm 1.02$ | $1.57 \pm 0.52$ |

- Corrections of higher order in both $\alpha_{s}$ and $v$ can bring theory into agreement with experiment. (Zhang, Gao, and Zhao (2005), Gong, and Wang (2007), He, Fan, and Chao (2007), Zhang, Ma, and Chao (2008))
- $v^{2} \approx 0.3, \alpha_{s}(m) \approx 0.24$, thus relativistic correction is as significant as radiation correction. And contribution of colour octet states is as important as that of colour singlet states.
- Cross section for $e^{+} e^{-} \rightarrow H_{c \bar{c}}+\gamma$ can be larger than that for $e^{+} e^{-} \rightarrow J / \Psi+\mathrm{H}$ by 2 orders, and thus could be observed at B-factory. (Chung, Lee, and Yu, 2008)

$$
e^{+}+e^{-} \rightarrow H_{c \bar{c}}+\gamma
$$

## Previous works:

- Chung, Lee, and Yu (2008):

LO for $S$-wave and $P$-wave

- Sang, and Chen (2010): NLO in $\alpha_{s}^{0}$ for $S$-wave and $P$-wave, NLO in $v$ for $\eta_{c}$;
- Li, Xu, Liu, and Zhang (2013); NLO in both $\alpha_{s}^{0}$ and $v$ for $S$-wave and $P$-wave
(Contributions of color octet operators were not considered);


## Hamiltonian:

$$
\begin{align*}
H_{e f f} & =-\frac{1}{2 m} \bar{\Psi} \boldsymbol{D}^{2} \Psi+\frac{1}{2} \boldsymbol{B}^{2}+\frac{1}{2} \boldsymbol{E}^{2}+\cdots \\
& -\frac{1}{2 m} g \bar{\Psi} \boldsymbol{B} \cdot \sigma \Psi-\frac{1}{8 m^{2}} g \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{0}(\boldsymbol{D} \cdot \boldsymbol{E}-\boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{D}) \Psi+\cdots, \tag{1}
\end{align*}
$$

where

$$
\Psi=\binom{\psi}{\chi} \longleftarrow \text { field annihilates a heavy quark }
$$

(Newton-Wigner representation)

$$
\sigma^{i}=\gamma^{5} \gamma^{0} \gamma^{i}, \quad\left[\sigma^{i}, \sigma^{j}\right]=2 i \varepsilon^{i j k} \sigma^{j}
$$

Particle number densities:

$$
n_{ \pm}=\frac{1}{2} \Psi^{\dagger}\left(1 \pm \gamma^{0}\right) \Psi \quad \text { conserved individually }
$$

## Factorization

Decay rate:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\Gamma(H)=\sum_{n} \frac{2 \operatorname{Im} f_{n}(\Lambda)}{m^{d_{n}-4}}\langle H| O_{n}(\Lambda)|H\rangle \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

$f_{n}(\Lambda)$ : effective coupling constant
$\mathcal{O}_{n}(\Lambda)$ : four-fermion interactions

## Inclusive cross section:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma(H)=\sum_{n} F_{n}(\Lambda)\langle 0| O_{n}^{H}(\Lambda)|0\rangle \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

$F_{n}(\Lambda): \quad$ short-distance coefficients (SDCs)
Perturbative \& process-dependent
$\langle 0| \mathcal{O}_{n}^{H}(\Lambda)|0\rangle$ : long-distance matrix elements (LDMEs)
Nonperturbative \& process-independent

## Factorization at amplitude level

(for electromagnetic decay or exclusive electromagnetic production)

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathcal{M}(H)=\sum_{n} C_{n}\langle H| \bar{\Psi} \mathcal{K}_{n} \Psi|0\rangle \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

## Colour octet

Contribution of colour octet state and that of colour single state are of the same order in $v$ for $P$-wave states.

Considering $h_{c}$ for instance, taking $\mathcal{K} n=D^{i}$,

$$
\langle c \bar{c}| \bar{\Psi} D^{i} \Psi|0\rangle \sim v
$$

arising from amplitude for Fock state $|c \bar{c} g\rangle$
$v\langle c \bar{c} g| \bar{\Psi} D^{i} \Psi|0\rangle \sim v$

## QCD Factorization

## Velocity-scaling rules

| Operator | Estimate | Description |
| :--- | :---: | :--- |
| $\alpha_{s}$ | $v$ | effective quark-gluon coupling constant |
| $\psi$ | $(M v)^{3 / 2}$ | heavy-quark (annihilation) field |
| $\chi$ | $(M v)^{3 / 2}$ | heavy-antiquark (creation) field |
| $D_{t}$ | $M v^{2}$ | gauge-covariant time derivative |
| $\mathbf{D}$ | $M v$ | gauge-covariant spatial derivative |
| $g \mathbf{E}$ | $M^{2} v^{3}$ | chromoelectric field |
| $g$ B | $M^{2} v^{4}$ | chromomagnetic field |
| $g \phi$ (in Coulomb gauge) | $M v^{2}$ | scalar potential |
| $g \mathbf{A}$ (in Coulomb gauge) | $M v^{3}$ | vector potential |

"The sum in the factorization formula is a v expansion"

$$
e^{+}+e^{-} \rightarrow H_{c \bar{c}}+\gamma
$$

## QCD amplitude:

colour
singlet
colour octet

soft


## QCD amplitude:

The QCD amplitudes are calculated in the standard way.

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathcal{M}=-\frac{i}{s} V_{\mu} \mathcal{M}^{\prime \mu}=\frac{i}{s}\left(\delta^{i j}-\frac{Q^{i} Q^{j}}{\left(Q^{0}\right)^{2}}\right) V^{i} \mathcal{M}^{\prime i} \equiv \frac{i}{s} V^{\prime i} \mathcal{\mathcal { M } ^ { \prime i }} \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $Q=l_{1}+l_{2}, s=Q^{2}, V^{\mu}=\bar{v}\left(l_{2}\right) \gamma^{\mu} u\left(l_{1}\right), T^{\prime \mu}$ is the amplitude for the decay of a virtual photon. We stay in the rest frame of the hadron. Thus $\mathbf{p}_{1}+\mathbf{p}_{2}+\mathbf{k}_{g}=\mathbf{0}$, where $k_{g}$ is the momentum of the soft gluon.
(The final result is too lengthy to be presented here.)

## NRQCD amplitude:


colour octet


## more NRQCD vertexes:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{1}{8 m^{2}} i g \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{0}(\boldsymbol{E} \times \boldsymbol{D}-\boldsymbol{D} \times \boldsymbol{E}) \cdot \sigma \Psi \\
& -\frac{1}{8 m^{2}} \bar{\Psi} \boldsymbol{D}^{4} \Psi, \quad-\frac{1}{8 m^{3}} g \bar{\Psi}\left(\boldsymbol{D}^{2} \boldsymbol{B} \cdot \sigma+\boldsymbol{B} \cdot \sigma \boldsymbol{D}^{2}\right) \Psi
\end{aligned}
$$

## NRQCD Feynman rules:



## NRQCD operators:

$\eta_{c} \quad \frac{1}{m} \bar{\psi} \Psi, \quad-\frac{1}{m^{3}} \bar{\psi} \mathbf{D}^{2} \Psi, \quad \frac{1}{m^{3}} \bar{\psi} \mathbf{B} \Upsilon \Psi$
$\chi_{c 0} \quad-\frac{i}{m^{2}} \bar{\psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \Psi, \quad \frac{i}{m^{2}} \bar{\psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \mathbf{D}^{2} \Psi, \quad \frac{i}{m^{3}} \bar{\psi} \gamma^{0} \mathbf{E} \cdot \gamma \Psi$
$\chi_{c 1} \quad-\frac{i}{m^{2}} \bar{\Psi}(\gamma \times \mathbf{D})^{i} \Psi, \quad \frac{i}{m^{4}} \bar{\Psi}(\gamma \times \mathbf{D})^{i} \mathbf{D}^{2} \Psi, \quad \frac{i}{m^{3}} \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{0}(\gamma \times \mathbf{E})^{i} \Psi$
$\chi_{c 2} \quad-\frac{i}{m^{2}} \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{(i} D^{j)} \Psi, \quad \frac{i}{m^{4}} \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{(i} D^{j)} \mathbf{D}^{2} \Psi, \quad \frac{i}{m^{3}} \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{0} \gamma^{(i} E^{j)} \Psi$,
$\frac{i}{m^{4}} \bar{\Psi}\left(\gamma^{(i} D^{j)} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma-\frac{2}{5} \gamma^{(i} D^{j)} \mathbf{D}^{2}\right) \Psi$
? $\quad \frac{1}{m^{3}} \bar{\Psi}(\gamma \times B)^{i} \Psi$

## matching

To do matching, spinors in QCD amplitude are substituted by

$$
\left.\begin{array}{l}
u(p)=\sqrt{\frac{E(\mathbf{p}, m)+m}{2 E(\mathbf{p}, m)}}\binom{\xi}{\frac{\mathbf{p} \cdot \sigma}{E(\mathbf{p}, m)+m} \xi}, \\
v(p)=\sqrt{\frac{E(\mathbf{p}, m)+m}{2 E(\mathbf{p}, m)}}\left(\frac{\mathbf{p} \cdot \sigma}{E(\mathbf{p}, m)+m} \eta\right.  \tag{6}\\
\eta
\end{array}\right), ~ 又
$$

The QCD amplitude thus obtained are expanded in power series of $v$.
Contribution of a specific angular momentum state is extracted by decomposing the amplitude into spherical tensors (Coope, and Snider, 1970):

$$
\begin{equation*}
A^{i} B^{j}=A^{(i} B^{j)}+A^{[i} B^{j]}+\frac{1}{3} \boldsymbol{A} \cdot \boldsymbol{B} \delta^{i j} \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

The short-distance coefficients are obtained by matching QCD amplitude and NRQCD amplitude.

## SDCs for amplitude:

(The superscript corresponds to the order of the corresponding operator listed in page 13)

$$
\begin{array}{rlrl}
c_{\eta_{c}}^{(1)}=4 \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2} \mathbf{V}^{\prime} \times \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{k}}_{\mathbf{p}} & c_{\chi_{c 0}}^{(1)}=-\frac{4}{3} i(2 a-1) \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2} \dot{V}^{\prime} \epsilon_{p}^{*} \\
c_{\eta_{c}}^{(2)}=-\frac{8}{3} \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2} \mathbf{V}^{\prime} \times \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{k}}_{\mathbf{p}} & c_{\chi_{c 0}}^{(2)}=i\left(\frac{32}{15} a-\frac{6}{5}\right) \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2} \dot{V}^{\prime} \epsilon_{p}^{*} \\
c_{\eta_{c}}^{(3)}=4(1+a) \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2} \mathbf{V}^{\prime} \times \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{k}}_{\mathbf{p}} & c_{\chi_{c 0}}^{(3)}=\frac{2}{3}\left(4 a^{2}+6 a+1\right) \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2} V^{\prime} \times \epsilon_{p}^{*} \cdot \hat{k}_{p} \\
c_{\chi_{c 1}}^{(1)}=2 i \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2}\left[2(1+a)\left(\mathbf{V}^{\prime} \times \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*}\right)^{i}+\dot{V}^{\prime} \hat{k}_{p}\left(\epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \times \hat{\mathbf{k}}_{\mathbf{p}}\right)^{i}\right] \\
c_{\chi_{c 1}}^{(2)}=-\frac{2}{5} i \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2}\left[2(8+3 a)\left(\mathbf{V}^{\prime} \times \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*}\right)^{i}+4 \dot{V}^{\prime} \hat{k}_{p}\left(\epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \times \hat{\mathbf{k}}_{\mathbf{p}}\right)^{i}\right]
\end{array}
$$

## armonium Production

## SDCs for amplitude :

$c_{\chi_{c 1}}^{(3)}=2 \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2}\left[\left(2 a^{2}+3 a+2\right)\left(V^{\prime} \times \epsilon_{p}^{*}\right)^{i}+(1+a) V^{\prime} \cdot \hat{k}_{p}\left(\epsilon_{p}^{*} \times \hat{k}_{p}\right)^{i}\right]$
$c_{\chi_{c 2}}^{(1)}=2 i \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2}\left(\mathbf{V}^{\prime} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \hat{k}_{p}^{i} \hat{k}_{p}^{j}-2 a V^{\prime i} \epsilon_{p}^{* j}-\dot{V}^{\prime} \hat{k}_{p} \hat{k}_{p}^{i} \epsilon_{p}^{* j}\right)+i \rightleftharpoons j:$
$c_{\chi c 2}^{(2)}={ }_{i \pi} \alpha Q_{c}^{2}\left(2 a V^{\prime i} \epsilon_{p}^{* j}-\frac{6}{5} \mathbf{V}^{\prime} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \hat{k}_{p}^{i} \hat{k}_{p}^{j}-2 \dot{V}^{\prime} \hat{k}_{p} \hat{k}_{p}^{i} \epsilon_{p}^{* j}\right)+i \rightleftharpoons j$
$c_{\chi_{c 2}}^{(3)}=\pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2}\left[\left(4 a^{2}+2 a\right) V^{\prime \prime} \epsilon_{p}^{* j}-2(1+a) \mathbf{V}^{\prime} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \hat{k}_{p}^{i} \hat{k}_{p}^{j}+2(1+a) \dot{V}^{\prime} \hat{k}_{p} \hat{k}_{p}^{i} \epsilon_{p}^{* j}\right]+i \rightleftharpoons j ;$
$c_{\chi_{c 2}}^{(4)}=i \pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2}\left[\frac{50}{21} a V^{\prime i} \epsilon_{p}^{* j}-\left(\frac{20}{s 1} a+\frac{1}{7}\right) \mathbf{V}^{\prime} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}^{*} \hat{k}_{p}^{i} \hat{k}_{p}^{j}+\left(\frac{5}{21}-\frac{40}{21} a\right) \dot{V}^{\prime} \hat{k}_{p} \hat{k}_{p}^{i} \epsilon_{p}^{* j}\right]+i \rightleftharpoons j$
$c_{?}^{(1)}=\pi \alpha Q_{c}^{2}\left[2(1+2 a) \dot{V}^{\prime} \hat{k}_{p} \epsilon_{p}^{* i}-4(1+a) \dot{V}^{\prime} \epsilon_{p}^{*} \hat{k}_{p}^{i}\right]$
where $\epsilon_{p}^{*}$ is the polarization vector for the photon, and $a=\frac{m}{\left|\mathbf{k}_{p}\right|}$.

## armonium Production

## cross section

The cross section is obtained by summing the squared norm of amplitude over polarizations, and integrating over phase space.

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma=\frac{(2 \pi)^{4}}{2 s} \int d \Pi \sum|\mathcal{M}|^{2} \delta^{4}\left(Q-\sum_{i} p_{i}\right) \tag{8}
\end{equation*}
$$

where the summation of $|\mathcal{M}|^{2}$ is taken over all the polarizations of particles in the final state, $d \Pi \equiv \prod_{i} \frac{d^{3} \mathbf{p}_{i}}{(2 \pi)^{3} 2 E\left(\mathbf{p}_{i}\right)}$, and $\sum_{i} p_{i}$ is the total momentum of the final state.

Hadron mass $M$ arising from phase space integration can be eliminated by applying Gremm-Kapustin relation, which is a direct consequence of a more general relation:

$$
(M-2 m)\langle 0| \mathcal{O}_{n}|H\rangle=\langle 0|\left[\mathcal{O}_{n}, H\right]|H\rangle
$$

## cross section

(To save writing, here I only explicitly show the result for $\chi_{c 0}$ )

$$
\begin{aligned}
\sigma= & \frac{8 \pi^{2} \alpha^{3} Q_{c}{ }^{4}\left(s-M^{2}\right)\left(s-4 m^{2}\right)^{2}}{9 s^{3} m^{2}\left(s-4 m^{2}\right)^{2}}\langle 0| \mathcal{O}_{1}\left({ }^{3} P_{0}\right)|0\rangle \\
& +\frac{8 \pi^{2} \alpha^{3} Q_{c}{ }^{4}\left(s-M^{2}\right)\left(s-4 m^{2}\right)\left(96 s m^{2}-560 m^{4}-9 s^{2}\right)}{45 s^{3} m^{2}\left(s-4 m^{2}\right)^{3}}\langle 0| \mathcal{P}_{1}\left({ }^{3} P_{0}\right)|0\rangle \\
& +\frac{4 \pi^{2} \alpha^{3} Q_{c}{ }^{4}\left(s-M^{2}\right)\left(s-4 m^{2}\right)}{9 s^{3} m^{2}\left(s-4 m^{2}\right)^{3}}\langle 0| \mathcal{T}_{8}\left({ }^{3} P_{0}\right)|0\rangle
\end{aligned}
$$

where

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{O}_{1}\left({ }^{3} P_{0}\right)=-\frac{1}{3} \bar{\Psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \Psi \bar{\Psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \Psi \\
& \langle 0| \mathcal{P}_{1}\left({ }^{3} P_{0}\right)|0\rangle=\frac{1}{6} \bar{\Psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \Psi \bar{\Psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \mathbf{D}^{2} \Psi+\frac{1}{6} \bar{\Psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \mathbf{D}^{2} \Psi \bar{\Psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \Psi \\
& \langle 0| \mathcal{T}_{8}\left({ }^{3} P_{0}\right)|0\rangle=\frac{1}{6} \bar{\Psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \Psi \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{0} \mathbf{E} \cdot \gamma \Psi+\frac{1}{6} \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{0} \mathbf{E} \cdot \gamma \Psi \bar{\Psi} \mathbf{D} \cdot \gamma \Psi
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
H_{c \bar{c}} \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma
$$

QCD amplitude:
colour singlet


## colour octet


$+$

## NRQCD amplitude:

## colour singlet

colour octet


NRQCD amplitude for decay is just the complex conjugate of that for production with different SDCs.

## matching

Similar to the case of production, the SDCs are obtained by matching QCD amplitude and NRQCD amplitude. The decay rate is obtained by summing the squared norm of amplitude over polarizations, and integrating over phase space.

$$
\begin{equation*}
\Gamma=\frac{(2 \pi)^{4}}{2 M} \int d \Pi \sum|\mathcal{M}|^{2} \delta^{4}\left(P-\sum_{i} p_{i}\right) \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

(The detail of the result is too lengthy to be presented here, and is thus omitted.)

The SDCs for amplitude are exactly the same as those in Sang (2013), which are obtained by FWT transformation. And SDCs for decay rate are the same as those in Brambilla, Mereghetti, and Vairo (2006), which are obtained by matching decay rate directly.

We calculated the relativistic corrections for the production of charmonia with $J \leq 2$, for which, contributions of colour octet operators were considered.

We verified that the SDCs were independent of the hadron state.

The LO results were consistent with those in Chung, Lee, and Yu (2008), and Sang and Chen (2010).

The relativistic corrections differed from those in Li, Xu, Liu, and Zhang (2013).

Thanks for your attention!

