## The Initial XYZ Program at BESIII (2010–2014)



30 Years of BES Symposium – September 5, 2019 – Ryan Mitchell

## The Initial XYZ Program at BESIII (2010-2014)

**Prologue:** Two Groundbreaking Discoveries (2003 – 2005)

**Chapter 1:** Studying  $\psi(4040)$  Decays (2010 – 2011)

Interlude: Three Informative Discoveries (2010 – 2011)

Chapter 2: The XYZ Proposal at Higher Energies (2011 – 2012)

Chapter 3: The Initial Running at 4260 and 4360 MeV (2013)

**Chapter 4:** Discovery of the  $Z_c(3900)$  (2013)

Chapter 5: Further Analyses of the 2013 XYZ Data (2013 – 2014)

**Postscript:** The XYZ Program at BESIII

*30 Years of BES Symposium – September 5, 2019 – Ryan Mitchell* 

# Prologue: Two Groundbreaking Discoveries

### Timeline

2003: Discovery of the X(3872) by Belle
2005: Discovery of the Y(4260) by BaBar



(PRL91,262001(2003))



### Timeline

June 3, 2010:  $\psi(4040)$  proposal talk by Changzheng (Shenyang collaboration meeting)

### Two important issues

- Find excited charmonium states
  - 2P states  $\chi'_{cJ}$  via  $\psi$ (4040) radiative transition
  - S-wave spin-singlet (M1 transition, very hard)
- Understand C-even XYZ
  - Can be produced in  $\psi(4040)$  radiative decays
  - For example: inclusive photon spectrum
  - X(3872)→ππJ/ψ, πππJ/ψ, …
  - XYZ(3940)→ωJ/ψ, DDbar, DD\*, …
  - X(3915)→ωJ/ψ, …

We propose to do these with  $\psi(4040)$  data!

## Let's do it!

- Study of charmonium spectroscopy & XYZ particles is one of the hot topics in HEP
- $\psi(4040)$  data can also be used for
  - Ds study (BES yellow book)
  - R & Rc measurement (Zhengguo's talk)
- Accelerator experts: do not you want to see if you can reach high energy?
- Accumulating 200/pb data only needs two (2) months, but the physics is rich!

Thanks a lot!

Join us and/or support us!

Changzheng — June 3, 2010 (Shenyang collaboration meeting)

### Timeline

**October 21-24, 2010:** Charm 2010 conference at IHEP (observation of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^-h_c(1P)$  at CLEO) **October 25, 2010:**  $\psi(4040)$  proposal talk by Changzheng (approved) (IHEP collaboration meeting) **November 17, 2010:** First meeting of the  $\psi(4040)$  working group (Liangliang)



Changzheng – October 25, 2010 (IHEP collaboration meeting)

Timeline

May 3 - June 1, 2011: Collect 470 pb<sup>-1</sup> [482] of data at 4010 MeV [4007.6]

## Data accumulation

- From 3rd May 2011, RUN 23463, to 1st June
- About 470 pb<sup>-1</sup>  $\psi$ (4040) been collected around 4.010 GeV CMS



*Kai* – *June* 5, 2011 (*Nanjing collaboration meeting*)

### Timeline

June - September, 2011: Initial analyses of the 4010 data

### Summary

Very preliminary results

- $\sigma(\psi(4040) \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^- J/\psi) = 12.7 \pm 0.7(uu)/12.2 \pm 1.1(ee)$  pb at 4.009 GeV
- $\sigma(\psi(4040) \rightarrow \gamma X(3872) \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+ \pi^- J/\psi) < 0.08(uu)/0.14(ee)$  pb at 90% C.L.
- $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma_{ISR}\psi') = 719.3 \pm 5.5(uu)/688.3 \pm 8.8(ee)$  pb, agree well with theoretical expectation.
- $\sigma(\psi(4040) \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^-h_c) < 2.6 \text{ pb at } 90\% \text{ C.L.}$

Lots need to do: understanding the difference between  $\mu\mu$  and *ee* in ISR process (around  $3\sigma$  in terms of statistical errors only, could be due to the systematic error of PID), input-output check, estimate the systematic uncertainties, etc.

## Thanks!

### Legacy of $\psi(4040)$ running

- the  $\psi(4040)$  working group
- confidence at higher  $E_{cm}$
- benchmarks for key processes
- a large  $\eta J/\psi$  cross section
- $[D_s \text{ physics (also in WG)}]$

Kai and Yuping – September 15, 2011 (PKU collaboration meeting)

## Interlude: Three Informative Discoveries

Timeline

**October 21, 2010:** Observation of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^-h_c(1P)$  at CLEO (Charm 2010 conference at IHEP)



*Ryan – October 21, 2010 (Charm 2010)* 

published July 2011 (PRL107,041803(2011))

## Interlude: Three Informative Discoveries

Timeline

March 2, 2011: Observation of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^-h_b(1P,2P)$  at Belle (La Thuile 2011)





## Interlude: Three Informative Discoveries

Timeline

( $\leq$ ) May 2011: Observation of  $Z_b$  and  $Z'_b$  at Belle (arXiv:1105.4583)



published March 2012 (PRL108,122001(2012))

# Chapter 2: The XYZ Proposal at Higher Energies (2011–2012)

### Timeline

2011: Initial discussions about running at higher  $E_{cm}$  (concurrent with  $\psi(4040)$  analyses)

### **OVERVIEW and GOALS**

- I. Three sources of inspiration (leaving many unanswered questions):
  - A. **BaBar** and **Belle** ISR data  $\Rightarrow$  **Y**(**4260**) and **Y**(**4360**)
  - B. CLEO 4170 data (and a little 4260 data)  $\Rightarrow$  Y(4260) and h<sub>c</sub>(1P)
  - C. Belle " $\Upsilon(5S)$ " data  $\Rightarrow$  Y<sub>b</sub>(10890), h<sub>b</sub>(1P), h<sub>b</sub>(2P), Z<sub>b</sub><sup>±</sup>(10610), Z<sub>b</sub><sup>±</sup>(10650)
    - $\Rightarrow$  Interesting times!
- II. Unique opportunities at **BESIII** to pick up this line of development:
  - A. Study the Y(4260)
  - B. Search for  $Z_c$  states
  - C. Study the Y(4360)
  - D. Search for the  $h_c(2P)$
  - $\Rightarrow$  Luminosity required is ~600pb<sup>-1</sup>: (~100pb<sup>-1</sup> at 4210, 4260, 4310, 4360, 4410, 4460 MeV)



*Ryan* – *November 30, 2011 (IHEP collaboration meeting)* 

2

# Chapter 2: The XYZ Proposal at Higher Energies (2011–2012)

### Timeline

Late 2011 – 2012: Meetings for the XYZ proposal (alternating with  $\psi(4040)$  group meetings) March 1, 2012: XYZ proposal talk by Ryan (IHEP collaboration meeting)

### **BESIII Data-Taking Proposal**

**PROPOSAL:** Take ~500pb<sup>-1</sup> (or more) of data at two energy points – 4260 and 4360 MeV.

### Example uses:

- Use the large sample at 4260 MeV to study the Y(4260)  $\rightarrow \pi^+\pi^- J/\psi$  Dalitz plot.
- Use the large sample at 4360 MeV to study the Y(4360)  $\rightarrow \pi^+\pi^-\psi(2S)$  Dalitz plot.
- Use the large sample at 4360 MeV to search for  $Y(4360) \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^-h_c(2P)$ .
- To establish other Y(4260) decay modes, use the 4260 data as "on-resonance" and the 4360 data as "off-resonance" data (and vice-versa for Y(4360) decays).
- (Also use other datasets (3770, 4010, D<sub>s</sub> points, etc.) as "off-resonance" data.)



*Ryan* – *March* 1, 2012 (*IHEP collaboration meeting*)

25

# Chapter 2: The XYZ Proposal at Higher Energies (2011–2012)

### Timeline

March - June, 2012: Formal XYZ proposals developed by the XYZ working group June 12, 2012: Approval for 4260 and 4360 MeV running (Suzhou collaboration meeting) (initial estimate is 50 days each for 500 pb<sup>-1</sup>)

#### Proposal to Study Heavy States of Charmonium Using Data at 4260 MeV and 4360 MeV

#### XYZ Group (Dated: June 1, 2012)

We propose to collect two sets of data using  $e^+e^-$  collisions with center of mass energies 4260 and 4360 MeV – corresponding to the Y(4260) and Y(4360), respectively – each with integrated luminosities of at least 500 pb<sup>-1</sup>. This would provide us with unique samples of Y(4260) and Y(4360) decays. These decays are not only important for investigating the mysterious nature of the Y(4260) and Y(4360) states themselves, which are strong hybrid meson candidates, but they would also allow a number of searches for exotic charged charmonium states ( $Z_c$ ), searches for conventional charmonium states (for example, the  $h_c(2P)$ ), and new studies of open charm cross sections, among other topics.

Measurement of resonances parameters of excited  $\psi$ s and the Ys and search for XYZ states

#### $ABC^1$

#### (XYZ working group)

<sup>1</sup>Institute of High Energy Physics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing (Dated: May 1, 2012)

#### Abstract

We propose BESIII take data between 3.8 GeV and 5.0 GeV for a precision measurement of the resonance parameters of the excited  $\psi$  states ( $\psi(4040)$ ,  $\psi(4160)$ , and  $\psi(4415)$ ) and the Y states (Y(4008), Y(4260), Y(4360), and Y(4660)). With data accumulated at some resonance peaks, the C-parity even charmonium and charmoniumlike states can be searched for via radiative transitions, while some other states, such as the isospin-one charmoniumlike state  $Z_c$  and the P-wave spin-singlet states  $h_c(2P)$ , can be studied via hadronic transitions.

Ecm energy (GeV)	Lum $(pb^{-1})$	Note	Ecm energy (G	GeV) Lum $(pb^{-1})$	Note	Ecm energy (	$(GeV)$ Lum $(pb^{-1})$	Note
3.800	50		4.210	50		4.510	50	
3.820	50		4.220	50		4.530	50	
3.840	50		4.225	50	$D^*_{\circ}D^*_{\circ}$	4.550	50	
3.860	50		4 230	50	- s- s	4 570	50	
3.864	50		4 240	50		4 575	50	A threshold
3.868	50	المعام مع	4.250	50		4.570	50	n <sub>c</sub> un conoid
3.872	50 50	$D^*D$ threshold	4.250	50	V(1960)	4.500	50	
3.880	50 50		4.200	500	I(4200)	4.590	50 50	
3.885	50 50		4.270	50		4.600	50	
3.900	50	G(3900)	4.280	50		4.610	50	
3.910	50	G(0000)	4.290	50		4.620	50	
3.920	50		4.300	50		4.630	500	Y(4630)
3.930	50		4.310	50		4.640	50	
3.940	50		4.320	50		4.650	50	
3.950	50		4.330	50		4.660	500	Y(4660)
3.960	50		4.340	50		4.670	50	
3.970	50		4.350	50		4.680	50	
3.980	50		4 355	50		4 690	50	
3.990	50		4.360	500	V(4360)	4.030	50	
4.000	50		4.300	500	1 (4300)	4.710	50	
4.005	50	((40.40) + 1	4.303	50		4.750	50	
4.009	500	$\psi(4040)$ , taken	4.370	50		4.750	50	
4.015	50 50	$D^*D^*$ threshold	4.380	50		4.770	50	
4.020	50		4.390	50		4.790	50	
4.025	50 50		4.400	50		4.810	50	
4.040	50	$\frac{1}{2}(4040)$	4.410	50		4.860	50	
4.050	50	$\psi(1010)$	4.415	500	$\psi(4415)$	4.910	50	$\Sigma_c$ threshold
4.060	50		4.420	50		4.920	50	
4.070	50		4.430	50		4.940	50	
4.080	50	$D_s D_s^*$ threshold	4,440	50		4.960	50	
4.090	50		4 450	50		5 000	50	
4.100	50		4.460	50		0.000	00	
4.110	50		4.400	50				
4.120	50		4.470	50				
4.130	50		4.480	50				
4.140	50		4.490	50				
4.150	50	((11.00))						
4.160	500	$\psi(4160)$						
4.170	50							
4.180	50 50							
4.190	50							

### Timeline

 December 14, 2012 - January 14, 2013:
 Collect 515 pb<sup>-1</sup> [524] at 4260 MeV [4258]

 January 14 - 20, 2013:
 Collect 3 x ~50 pb<sup>-1</sup> at points near 4260 MeV

 January 27 - February 24, 2013:
 Collect 523 pb<sup>-1</sup> [539] at 4360 MeV [4358]

 February 24 - 27, 2013:
 Collect 2 x ~50 pb<sup>-1</sup> at points near 4360 MeV

 (additional points due to good machine performance)



Party at the BEPC control room — January 15, 2013

### Timeline

**January – February, 2013:** Intense investigations of the initial data (long XYZ meetings),  $\pi^{+}\pi^{-}J/\psi$ : from the proposal  $\pi^{+}\pi^{-}J/\psi$ : from the data



### Timeline

January - February, 2013: Intense investigations of the initial data (long XYZ meetings)



### Timeline

February 27, 2013: A long list of intriguing results shown at the Tsinghua meeting February 28, 2013: XYZ group writes a new proposal during the Tsinghua meeting banquet March 1, 2013: Propose to extend the XYZ run period (approved)



Ryan — March 1, 2013 (Tsinghua collaboration meeting)

# Chapter 4: Discovery of the $Z_c(3900)$ (2013)



# Chapter 4: Discovery of the $Z_c(3900)$ (2013)

```
Timeline
February, 2013:
    Convincing evidence for the Z_c(3900)
February 27 - March 1, 2013 (Tsinghua):
    Discussions of publication strategy
March 3, 2013:
    First draft of the memo and paper
March 5, 2013:
   Review committee formed
     (Xinchou(ch), Yuanning, Fred, Matt)
March 4 - 7, 2013:
   Many iterations on the paper draft
March 4 - 7, 2013:
   Many studies by many people
     (dE/dx, E_{CM}, Luminosity, other E_{CM},
      neutral mode, ISR corrections, PWA)
March 8, 2013:
    Zhiqing talk at the P&S meeting
March 18, 2013:
   Referee-author meeting with
      extensive cross-checks
March 20 - 22, 2013:
    Shortened collaboration-wide review
March 24, 2013:
    Submission to the arXiv and PRL
March 27, 2013:
    Special seminar at IHEP
March 28, 2013:
    XYZ party in the BESIII control room
```

### Timeline

### $\rightarrow$ March 30, 2013:

Belle  $Z_c(3900)$  paper submitted to arXiv May 2, 2013:

```
BESIII Paper accepted by PRL
```



published June 2013 (PRL110,252002(2013))

# Chapter 4: Discovery of the $Z_c(3900)$ (2013)

### Timeline

**December, 2013:** Discovery of the  $Z_c(3900)$  named a "Highlight of the Year"

8/30/19, 11:34

Chinese collider expands particle zoo | symmetry magazine

8/30/19, 11:31 AM

#### Symmetry dimensions of particle physics

### Chinese collider expands particle zoo

#### 12/09/13 | By Kelen Tuttle

China's Beijing Electron-Positron Collider seems to be hosting a reunion; members of a poorly understood family of particles keep popping up in their data, which may help clarify the properties of this reclusive family.



### Notes from the Editors: Highlights of the Year

December 30, 2013 • Physics 6, 139

Physics looks back at the standout stories of 2013.



#### Four-Quark Matter

Quarks come in twos and threes—or so nearly every experiment has told us. This summer, the BESIII Collaboration in China and the Belle Collaboration in Japan reported they had sorted through the debris of high-energy electron-positron collisions and seen a <u>mysterious particle</u> that appeared to contain four quarks. Though other explanations for the nature of the particle, dubbed  $Z_c(3900)$ , are possible, the "tetraquark" interpretation may be gaining traction: BESIII has since <u>seen</u> a series of other particles that appear to contain four quarks.

https://physics.aps.org/articles/v6/139

Page 1 of 5

*The Initial XYZ Program (2010 – 2014) – Ryan Mitchell* 

Page 1 of 4

20

# Chapter 5: Further Analyses of the 2013 XYZ Data (2013–2014)

### Timeline

March - June, 2013: Extensive XYZ meetings and an explosion of analyses June, 2013: XYZ group disbanded

 $+e^- \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+ \pi^- J/\psi$  (data)



# Chapter 5: Further Analyses of the 2013 XYZ Data (2013–2014)



# Postscript: The XYZ Program at BESIII



The XYZ program has grown into an important component of BESIII physics!